

#### **How to Cite**

Ardhana, I. K. ., Pageh, I. M. ., Arjani, N. L. ., & Wulandari, N. P. D. . (2020). The cultural process of symbolic violence affecting introvert English education department students in educational universities in Bali. *International Journal of Humanities, Literature & Arts*, 3(1), 41-50. <https://doi.org/10.31295/ijhla.v3n1.172>

# **The Cultural Process of Symbolic Violence Affecting Introvert English Education Department Students in Educational Universities in Bali**

#### **I Ketut Ardhana**

*Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia*

*Email: [phejepsdrliipi@yahoo.com](mailto:phejepsdrliipi@yahoo.com)*

#### **I Made Pageh**

*Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia*

*Email: [madepagehundiksha@gmail.com](mailto:madepagehundiksha@gmail.com)*

#### **Ni Luh Arjani**

*Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia*

*Email: [arjani\\_psw@yahoo.com](mailto:arjani_psw@yahoo.com)*

#### **Ni Putu Desi Wulandari**

*Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia*

*Corresponding author email: [freshaple89@gmail.com](mailto:freshaple89@gmail.com)*

**Abstract---***This research is aimed at investigating the cultural process of symbolic violence affecting introvert students in English education departments of educational universities in Bali; Mahasaraswati University Denpasar, Ganesha University Singaraja of Education, and IKIP Saraswati Tabanan. The subjects of this study were the introvert students of English education departments in those educational universities. The introvert students were decided through Myers – Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) test. The data were gathered through in-depth interviews with a blueprint formalized with the keys of symbolic domination namely, (1) Habitus, (2) Arena, and (3) Capital. The critical qualitative approach is used as the approach of this study; therefore, the analysis style is critical descriptive.*

**Keywords---***critical pedagogy; cultural process; English learning; introvert; symbolic violence.*

## **Introduction**

There is a strong stereotype of the Indonesian educational environment, especially in Bali about the characteristics of intelligent students. The stereotype stated that students could only be called intelligent if he or she is verbally and interpersonally active in classroom activities. The root of this stereotype is the existence of the extrovert ideal in society. The extrovert ideal is an omnipresent belief that the ideal self is gregarious, alpha, and comfortable in the spotlight. The archetypal extrovert prefers action to contemplation, risk-taking to heed talking, certainty to doubt. He favors quick decisions, even at the risk of being wrong (Cain, 2013; Hyman, 2010; Koeze, 2007). According to the statement, the qualities of the ideal-self expected by society are closely related to extrovert personality. Introverted individuals, on the other hand, have no ideal characteristics regarding the ideal. Thus, introverts tend to be marginalized and violated by the ideal applied.

The concept of introvert and extrovert was taken from the analytical psychology formulated by a Swiss psychologist, Carl Gustav Jung in the 1920s. Jung believes that to understand a person's behavior, personality analysis must be carried out. The differences in personality and behavior according to Jung are no longer a positive and negative issue but the uniqueness of each individual (Cain, 2013; McLeod *et al.*, 2003; Agra *et al.*, 2018; Coy *et*

*al.*, 2011). One of the personality classifications formulated was extrovert – introvert. The formulation was designed according to human socialization tendency. Extroverted individuals are very comfortable to be in social situations for a long period and enjoy interacting with other individuals. Whereas, someone who has an introverted personality tends to focus on his mental and personal state. Introverted individuals are individuals who are quiet, reserved, and uncomfortable being in social interaction for a long period (Leung, 2015; Croizet *et al.*, 2017; Morgan & Björkert, 2006). Leung adds that the energy and enthusiasm of extroverted individuals are obtained from their interactions with other individuals while in introvert’s energy and enthusiasm obtained through silence and solitude. This personality typeset is well known to be paired with several other personality type sets by Isabel Briggs-Myers in the 1940s well known as Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI).

Bali applies extrovert ideals to its cultural realm. It is assumed due to the cultural characteristics of Balinese people that are encouraging collectivism, not individualism. Bali’s community is highly communal as they gather in a large and small community group where they build a strong connection to each other. The community group system is called “Banjar”. the *banjar* forms the most basic unit for a sense of the collective (Houston & Lesmana, 2012). An individual, as a member of the Banjar should maintain strong and frequent interaction with other Banjar members. Banishment from the *banjar* ranked among the most severe punishments a person could experience (Houston & Lesmana, 2012). In this concept, individuality is considered a punishment. On the other hand, introverts need several times of solitude and a short time of social interaction in a day to be biologically well-functioned. *Acetylcholine*, a neurotransmitter that produces the sensation of happiness a motivation on introverts could only be produced in solitude and quiet surrounding (Lei, 2015; Ojha *et al.*, 2009; Winskell & Sabben, 2016). The limited time of solitude and prolonged time of social interaction would decrease the level of happiness and motivation on their brain. Therefore, living in Bali as a member of Banjar, a community system that upholds extrovert ideal would highly disadvantaged and somewhat violated introvert individuals’ right.

In a *banjar*, frequent communal and interpersonal activities are requirements to be met by every member of it. Those who could not fulfill the requirements would be punished according to the rule. In the community, this system looks positive as it could maintain the community’s wholeness and brotherhood, on the other hand, this could be symbolic violence for the introverts. Symbolic violence is formulated by Pierre Bourdieu, a French sociologist as a form of subtle and invisible violence that is not realized by either the upper-class group (the dominant party) and the “victim” or the so-called lower class because it is considered to be something normal and has no harm (Bujorean, 2016). The community system which upholds strong engagements to each other would automatically demerit introverts.

Unfortunately, the educational system in extroverted society, especially in Bali adopts the value pattern from the society. Damsar (2011) stated that the society and educational institution has a reciprocal relationship and influence each other. The educational institution would adopt the value from the society and the input of the educational system would form the society value. On its ideal projection, educational institution is the institution that plays an important role in building humanist quality in every individual in order to the more qualified and idealist community. According to the goal, the implementation of educational process in educational institution should always lead the students to have critical awareness, embody democratic process of learning and involve in activities that optimize all the potentials they have. If educational institutions oppose the stated values and maintain the stigma about introversion as a personality disorder or a disease, the educational institution will eventually become a place of symbolic violence towards introverted students. Symbolic violence is increasingly unnoticed if it is carried out in educational institutions, considering that educational institutions tend to have good prestige, so that people entrust their children’s education to educational institutions.

This research is focused on the cultural process of symbolic violence in English education departments in Bali Universities to introvert students. Higher education was chosen because it has more unique pedagogical process than the lower ones. It has more prestigious and complex pedagogical process that tend to be more oppressive to its personnel. Moreover, regarding to language departments (according to the tracing down process has been done by the researcher to the department’s syllabus), they have more verbal and communal rich lectures. The subjects of this study were introvert students in English education department in Bali universities. The universities that were chosen as the setting of this research are including (1) Mahasaraswati University, (2) Ganesha University of Education and (3) IKIP Saraswati. The students who are chosen as subject of this research were decided through MBTI test. MBTI test is a personality inventory test firmly grounded by Carl Jung theory of psychological test (Quenk, 2009). The test invented the psychological type of each student by formulating them in sets of personality. Each set of personality reveals a unique complex personality of a student, one of the elements is whether the student is extrovert or introvert. To fulfill the data of this research, introvert students who were decided through MBTI test took the further step of this research’s data gathering that was an in-depth interview. The in-depth interview was conducted based on a blueprint

that was specially formularized to meet the need of this research (the blue print is presented on the discussion). The concept utilized to build up the blue print is the three keys of symbolic domination namely; arena, habitus and capital. An arena is a field where a symbolic violence is applied, a habitus is a symbolic value transmitted simultaneously and capital is a tool possessed by a dominant or upper class maintain domination and the transmission symbolic values (Siregar, 2016). This concept considered suitable to explain the symbolic process occurred on the research field.

## Materials and Methods

The research applied a critical qualitative approach. A qualitative approach has become a tradition in social research which fundamentally relies on the observation of human interaction to their surroundings (Moleong, 2018). Critical theory was used to identify problem and generate the data therefore this research is not only a qualitative research but also a critical qualitative research. To gather the data the researchers applied an in-depth interview based on a blue print that was formularized with critical concept to meet the need of this research. The data were analyzed qualitatively (able to explore the depth of a problem) with the theoretical analysis and critical concepts. Based on the explanation, this study has the interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary and Transdisciplinary characteristics. The disciplines that integrated in this study consist of the social science, education and psychology. The synergy of these three sciences is expected to be able to sustain the analysis of the problems examined in this study.

## Results and Discussions

After the MBTI test was applied, 19 students were decided as introvert; 5 students from Mahasaraswati University, 8 students from Ganesha University of Education and 6 students from IKIP Saraswati. After the test they were directed to be involved in an in-depth interview. The in- depth interview was conducted based on a blueprint as follows.

Table 1  
The Blue Print of Data Gathering

The Key of Symbolic Domination	Data Sources	Dimension	Interview Question	Finding in Summary
Habitus	In-depth interview	Learning method, technique and approach	1. Mention the learning activities that are commonly applied in the classroom?  2. Is there any dominant activity applied or it is applied more frequent than the others?	Verbal and communal activity that applied more than the other types of activity such as reading, writing and listening.
		The Process and procedure of verbal and communal activity	1. Why do the verbal and communal activities applied more frequent than the others?	Lecturer's belief that verbal activities are the most effective activity to be applied in the classroom.

		Score, stimulus, gratification and reinforcement	1. Is there any benefits that you get if you are actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	Additional score for those who are actively participating in verbal activities.
		Self-concept	1. Is there any disadvantages that you get if you are not actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	Introvert students had poor self - concept that their introversion is a shortfall to be fixed and they have to try hard to imitated their extrovert friends to be recognized and gratified by their lecturer.
		Lecturer's correction	1. Is there any expectation, gratification, comments about students that are involving in verbal and communal activities?  2. What your lecturer would react if you are not actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	An expectation from the lecturers for introverted students to participate more on verbal and communal activities.
Arena	In-depth interview	Learning method, technique and approach.	1. Mention the learning activities that are commonly applied in the classroom?  2. Is there any dominant activity applied or it is applied more frequent than the others?	The learning process has formed as a "power arena" on a "conquering - conquered" system.
		The process and procedure of verbal	1. Why do the verbal and	The dominant class (educational

		activity.	communal activities applied more frequent than the others?	system, lecturers and extrovert students) has formed a “rule of game” to be followed by the marginal class (introverted students).
		Score, stimulus, gratification and reinforcement	1. Is there any benefits that you get if you are actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	The authoritative “rule of game” that fetter the marginalized class without any dialogic process has automatically applied on the scoring system.
		Self - concept	1. Is there any disadvantages that you get if you are not actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	The learning process, for the introvert students has become a “social battling arena”
		Lecturers’ Correction	1. Is there any expectation, gratification, comments about students that are involving in verbal and communal activities?  2. What your lecturer would react if you are not actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	Symbolic violence value on the “power arena” had been simultaneously embedded to the students on the learning process.
Capital	In-depth Interview	Learning method, technique and approach	1. Mention the learning activities that are commonly applied in the classroom?  2. Is there any dominant activity applied or it is applied more	The lecturers possess social capital on their relation to the students so that they could site in a dominant position or “power arena”.

	frequent than the others?	
The process and procedure of verbal activity	1. Why do the verbal and communal activities applied more frequent than the others?	The dominant position that is possessed by the lecturers influence their strategies to design the learning process.
Score, stimulus, gratification and reinforcement	1. Is there any benefits that you get if you are actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	Introvert students who were hardly possess cultural capital could not achieve good score and gratification easier compared than the extrovert ones.
Self - concept	1. Is there any disadvantages that you get if you are not actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	The difficulties in achieving good score and gratification lead the introvert students to feel marginalized from the leaning process.
Lecturer's correction	1. Is there any expectation, gratification, comments about students that are involving in verbal and communal activities?  2. What your lecturer would react if you are not actively involved in verbal and communal activities?	By possessing power on students' classroom learning process, the lecturers could deliver correction to the students based on the extrovert ideal values.

The interview was conducted once to each student. An in-depth interview has chosen as the most suitable type of interview for this research because the researchers wanted to gain deep information regarding to the issue emphasized in this research.

According to the interview, it was found that most the lectures the students were involved in were applied in the field of "Arena of Power". A structure of "the ruler and the ruled" was integrated. The "rulers" in this case are the dominant group, the lecturers and extroverted students who have cultural power over the introverted students, the marginalized group. In the lecture process, an oppressive and hegemonic interaction system is designed. The

dominant group has the authority to determine the values in a system that is formed. Bourdieu (1990) calls these values as the “rule of game”. In a lecture with extroverted idealism, extroverted values are used as a basic concept and idealism in designing lesson plans, class contracts and unwritten standards of behavior. Some students admitted that that lecture contracts have a content of symbolic violence by prioritizing verbal and communal activities over other types of activities. One of the students who admitted the information was Prabawati from UNMAS. Praba stated that “(verbal activity) is dominantly included in the lecture contract which also affects scores significantly...” As the symbolic capital possessed by the lecturer, the lecturer has a position as “the right one” in the “arena of power” and every decision they made to be applied in the classroom cannot be contested. Through the interview it was found that none of the students dared to question and challenge any decision the lecturers made. Dana Kartika from IKIP Saraswati stated that “Any kind of lecturer’s decision in the classroom has never been question by us, the students. Some of my friends may feel all right, the others were only avoiding conflicts. If we are obligated to be verbally active in the class, we must obey.” The assumption that a lecturer is a person who must be obeyed is a habitus that could have been instilled from generation to generation with various patterns and speculations. Regarding to the issue of this research, the lecturers implanted a disposition system in the form of a perception scheme that verbal activity was the most effective to be applied in class and gave expectations to all students without exception to meet the demands of the verbal activity that was applied. The disposition system according to Bourdieu (1990) is applied continuously so that the values and expectations conveyed are latent and durable. This led to the next habitus.

Over time an understanding is formed in every student’s mind that the disposition system is correct and appropriate without any critical thinking to be involved. Even if there is, this critical thinking is kept tightly by students because dialogical tendencies towards various things regarding lectures never happen, as conveyed by one participant student who stated that he felt injustice in class but conveying it to the lecturer was a risky task. Wisma from UNDIKSHA, the opinion provider, is a student participant who is quite critical of the injustices he experienced in the classroom. The statement he has stated on the interview were quite critical and cynical. He stated that “The most important thing to be done (in the classroom) is to be active (verbally active), there is no point in me being good at writing if the lecturer only assesses my verbal skill.” Wisma felt that in most lecture he involved in; he is not measured holistically but only through his verbal involvement in the classroom. Wisma further stated that “I feel better in writing than speaking in the classroom, but arguing about this is pointless.” This statement supports other previous student statement that the dominance in applying verbal activities in the classroom cannot be questioned, discussed or even contested. This seems an anomaly because amid the demands of lectures that students should participate more in verbal activities in class, dialogical processes rarely or never occur. The substance of verbal activity looks very shallow if it is only used as a requirement for the lecture process, not a dialogical process in conveying and discussing information. It prevents the lecturers to listen from their students about what how they feel comfortable the most in learning and for the bigger picture, their uniqueness in personality and learning style.

On its reality, especially according to the interview, introverted students feel increasingly marginalized and as if they are not integrated with the lecture process being undertaken. Introverted individuals are individuals who are substantive and reflective so that they consider question and answer, presentation, discussion which are used as a requirement and formality as untrue or cliché. Agni from UNMAS in the interview process stated that she often attended class discussion processes that were less substantive. She conveyed this by giving an example that her friends competed to express verbally about their opinions in the discussion to get extra score from the lecturers. “Because the lecturer promised that he would give additional scores to the students who are verbally active, my friends competed to speak in class” she stated. She argued that the opinions conveyed by her friends in verbal activities often have minimal meaning and are only conveyed to get additional score from the lecturer. Also, she is powerless to contest the “rule of game” that have been laid down in the arena of power she involved in regarding to the fact that she is a student who has lesser power in the relation to her lecturer and that she is an introvert student who hardly has cultural capital on learning value applied. The actors in the system (lecturers and students) play certain roles based on their cultural capita. According to the interview, lecturer has dominant cultural capita so that they could determine lecture standards with the capacity they are possessing and they value they adopt from the society to be obeyed by all students.

Educational institutions play an important role in the power arena, with a monopoly on power to concentrate and set rules for values and constantly trying to maintain belief in those values (Zurmailis & Faruk, 2017). The education system tends to reproduce the existing power structure where the class that has reproductive material has very strong control over the production of knowledge and its transmission (Mohammad, 2016) As has been explained in the discussion of the authority of educators in the learning process in the English education study program at Balinese universities, the relationship between lecturers and students tends to be a relationship between the authorization and

the authorization recipient. Classes that have reproductive material (in this case lecturers) have the power to control the values applied in learning. An understanding that an increase in the frequency of verbal and communal activities will affect increasing students' verbal competence. This indicates that the educational process that is carried out focused only on one of the basic language competencies, namely speaking. Plus, there was also an assumption that through verbal skills students' understanding of a material can be better assessed. This understanding is continuously implanted in the minds of students through certain actions (assignment of verbal and communal activities, giving added value) so that students enter the pattern and voluntarily follow the causality system.

The dominant class (lecturers and extrovert students) who have reproductive material maintains their position through the so-called hidden curriculum. Educational institutions influence the attitudes and habits of students by using the dominant class culture, where this is indeed a cultural value that is carried out in society. In connection with this study, the culture promoted by related educational institutions is a culture that applies extroverted idealism (based on the type of culture formulated by Lewis (2010) the dominant class forces the dominated class (lower class, marginalized) to behave and follow the dominant class culture through the process of education. It is seen from the frequency of verbal and communal activities designed for learning. Students from lower-class backgrounds (introverts) force themselves to develop characteristics that are owned by the dominant class (extrovert). Otherwise, they will be considered inappropriate or unacceptable in the class, learning process, educational institution they are involved in.

Utilizing the system above, the dominant class habitus is transformed into a form of cultural capital that students will and must take for granted without a dialogical process. With this pattern, those who have a habitus that is following the habitus of the dominant class, namely extroverted students will more easily achieve success in the educational process, while those who are unable to adjust their habitus, namely introverted students, will experience difficulties and failure. The next rule was that for introverted students to be successful, they had to carry out what was called the bourgeois process or to imitate the habitus of the dominant class, even though they had to force themselves and sacrifice their identity (dehumanization). The dominant class habitus is always positioned as the best and most perfect habitus.

The bourgeois process makes introverted students go through a phase called pseudo extroverts. Leung (2015) states that pseudo introverts are introverts who are under the domination of an extroverted culture so they tend to ignore their natural instinct as an introvert and "become extroverted" (adopt extroverted characteristics and apply it in themselves) to be accepted in their community and to be able achieving success. According to the interview, it was found that several student participants were indicated as pseudo extroverts. Students who participate in pseudo extroverts fall into two categories (1) not knowing themselves as introverts and (2) knowing themselves as introverts. Ika from UNDIKSHA stated "I previously did not understand what introverted and did not know that I was introverted" after receiving the results of the MBTI test which stated that she was an introvert. This answered her unrest over why she had difficulties in verbal and communal activities in class despite her hard work. The second category is student participants who already know that they are introverted but are powerless to fight against the extroverted cultural capital that is applied through high-frequency verbal and communal activities in the classroom. This can be seen in most of the student participants' answers on the interview which stated that they were uncomfortable in carrying out verbal and communal activities in class but were unable to discuss. All that can be done is to follow verbal and communal activities with this pattern because that way they can achieve a satisfying final score.

Thus, it can be concluded that the cultural process of symbolic violence against introverted students in the English study program at Balinese universities can be seen that the culture that applies extroverted idealism is transmitted in the learning process in the classroom. Cultural transmission with extroverted values produces injustice because it marginalizes introverted students who are unable to meet these values. This cultural transmission is applied repeatedly or becomes a cultural reproduction that establishes extroverted values as cultural capital that binds all students and forces them to fulfill it. This gives rise to pseudo extroverts who transform themselves into extroverts by adopting extroverted characteristics to be accepted in their learning environment.

## Conclusion

The cultural process of symbolic violence of higher education system in Bali universities has been gathered through an in-depth interview. The in-depth interview was conducted according to a blueprint that was specially formularized to meet the need for this research. The concept utilized to build up the blueprint is the three keys of symbolic domination namely; arena, habitus, and capital. According to the in-depth interview conducted it was found that



verbal and communal activity that applied more than the other types of activity such as reading, writing and listening. It happened due to the lecturer's belief that verbal activities are the most effective activity to be applied in the classroom. According to the belief additional score for those who are actively participating in verbal activities was given, therefore, introvert students had poor self-concept that their introversion is a shortfall to be fixed and they have to try hard to imitated their extrovert friends to be recognized and gratified more by their lecturer. There was also an expectation from the lecturers for introverted students to participate more on verbal and communal activities. It makes the learning process has formed as a "power arena" on a "conquering - conquered" system. The dominant class (educational system, lecturers and extrovert students) has formed a "rule of game" to be followed by the marginal class (introverted students). The authoritative "rule of game" that fetter the marginalized class without any dialogic process has automatically applied on the scoring system. The learning process for the introvert students on the other hand, has become a "social battling arena". Symbolic violence value on the "power arena" had been simultaneously embedded to the students on the learning process because the lecturers possess social capital on their relation to the students so that they could site in a dominant position or "power arena". The dominant position that is possessed by the lecturers influence their strategies to design the learning process. Introvert students who were hardly possess cultural capital could not achieve good score and gratification easier compared than the extrovert ones. The difficulties in achieving good score and gratification lead the introvert students to feel marginalized from the leaning process.

## References

- Agra, I. B., Gelgel, I. P., & Dharmika, I. B. (2018). Pressure on socio-cultural towards post-divorce Hindu women in Denpasar city. *International journal of social sciences and humanities*, 2(3), 63-78.
- Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J. C. (1990). *Reproduction in education, society and culture* (Vol. 4). Sage.
- Bujorean, E. (2016). *Symbolic Violence in Schools*. South Carolina: University of South Carolina
- Cain, S. (2013). *Quiet: The power of introverts in a world that can't stop talking*. Broadway Books.
- Coy, M., Wakeling, J., & Garner, M. (2011, September). Selling sex sells: Representations of prostitution and the sex industry in sexualised popular culture as symbolic violence. In *Women's studies international forum* (Vol. 34, No. 5, pp. 441-448). Pergamon. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2011.05.008>
- Croizet, J. C., Goudeau, S., Marot, M., & Millet, M. (2017). How do educational contexts contribute to the social class achievement gap: Documenting symbolic violence from a social psychological point of view. *Current opinion in psychology*, 18, 105-110. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2017.08.025>
- Damsar, D. (2011). *Pengantar Sosiologi Pendidikan*. Jakarta, Kencana.
- Houston, J. M., & Lesmana, C. B. J. (2012). Competitiveness and individualism-collectivism in Bali and the US.
- Hyman, S. E. (2010). The diagnosis of mental disorders: the problem of reification. *Annual review of clinical psychology*, 6, 155-179.
- Koeze, P. A. (2007). Differentiated instruction: The effect on student achievement in an elementary school.
- Lei, X., Yang, T., & Wu, T. (2015). Functional neuroimaging of extraversion-introversion. *Neuroscience bulletin*, 31(6), 663-675.
- Leung, W. F. (2015). Supporting Introversion and Extroversion Learning Styles in Elementary Classrooms.
- Lewis, R. (2010). *When cultures collide: Leading across cultures*. Nicholas Brealey International.
- McLeod, J., Fisher, J., & Hoover, G. (2003). *The key elements of classroom management: Managing time and space, student behavior, and instructional strategies*. ASCD.
- McLeod, J., Fisher, J., & Hoover, G. (2003). *The key elements of classroom management: Managing time and space, student behavior, and instructional strategies*. ASCD.
- Mohammad, S., Kiritchenko, S., Sobhani, P., Zhu, X., & Cherry, C. (2016, June). Semeval-2016 task 6: Detecting stance in tweets. In *Proceedings of the 10th International Workshop on Semantic Evaluation (SemEval-2016)* (pp. 31-41).
- Moleong, L. J. (2018). *Metodologi penelitian kualitatif*.
- Morgan, K., & Björkert, S. T. (2006, September). 'I'd rather you'd lay me on the floor and start kicking me': Understanding symbolic violence in everyday life. In *Women's Studies International Forum* (Vol. 29, No. 5, pp. 441-452). Pergamon. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2006.07.002>
- Ojha, H. R., Cameron, J., & Kumar, C. (2009). Deliberation or symbolic violence? The governance of community forestry in Nepal. *Forest Policy and Economics*, 11(5-6), 365-374. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.forpol.2008.11.003>
- Quenk, N. L. (2009). *Essentials of Myers-Briggs type indicator assessment* (Vol. 66). John Wiley & Sons.
- Siregar, M. (2016). *Teori "Gado-gado" Pierre-Felix Bourdieu*. AnImage.

- Winskell, K., & Sabben, G. (2016). Sexual stigma and symbolic violence experienced, enacted, and counteracted in young Africans' writing about same-sex attraction. *Social science & medicine*, *161*, 143-150. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2016.06.004>
- Zurmailis, Z., & Faruk, F. (2017). Doksa, kekerasan simbolik dan habitus yang ditumpangi dalam konstruksi kebudayaan di Dewan Kesenian Jakarta. *Adabiyāt: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, *1*(1), 44-72.