

How to Cite

Isdairi, & Sihaloho, N. T. P. (2021). Rebuilding the local government partnership model in tourism recovery after the COVID-19 pandemic: Case Study in Singkawang City, Indonesia. *International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(3), 346-352. <https://doi.org/10.31295/ijss.v4n3.1775>

Rebuilding the Local Government Partnership Model in Tourism Recovery after the COVID-19 Pandemic (Case Study in Singkawang City, Indonesia)

Isdairi

University of Tanjungpura, Pontianak, Indonesia

Email: isdairi@fisip.untan.ac.id

Nahot Tua Parlindungan Sihaloho

University of Tanjungpura, Pontianak, Indonesia

Corresponding author email: nahotsihaloho@fisip.untan.ac.id

Abstract---This research report explores government partnerships in the tourism sector in Singkawang City using the context of the COVID-19 pandemic. Tourism is also the sector that was first hit by restrictions on human mobility and will probably be the last to recover. This study aims to understand the condition of the tourism sector in Singkawang City during the COVID-19 pandemic and how this sector will recover in the future. To that end, this study explores the potential of multi-actor and multi-sector partnerships in restoring the tourism economy. Furthermore, this study uses a qualitative approach with in-depth online interviews with various tourism stakeholders in Singkawang City. This study resulted in a critical finding: the recovery of the tourism economy requires well-established strategic partnerships among various stakeholders. Partnerships must also be reciprocal and balanced for the recovery to run well. That is, a bottom-up approach should be prioritized; higher levels of the hierarchy should only facilitate the coordination process so that realities on the ground and national strategies are linked. This study makes a general recommendation that it is necessary to immediately reposition the government's role towards other stakeholders so that the ideal 'bottom-up' approach does not become mere rhetoric.

Keywords---collaboration, hospitality industry, partnership, tourism development, tourism stakeholders

Introduction

Tourism is one of the sectors most affected by the COVID-19 pandemic, considering that one of the instruments to suppress the increase in the number of cases is limiting human mobility. At that time, the boundaries between countries were tightened, even closed altogether, and only 'essential' mobility was allowed to pass through. Tourism, of course, does not fall into this 'essential' category. Globally, the tourism sector is predicted to lose 320 billion US dollars (Gössling et al., 2020). The number of unemployed worldwide generated by this industrial sector is estimated at 100.8 million people, of which 63.4 million people are from the Asia-Pacific region. In addition, the number of tourist arrivals in the first half of 2020 is expected to drop dramatically to 65% percent worldwide (Gössling et al., 2020).

Since March 2020, the movement of the tourism sector has begun to be seen, although it is very minimal. Some countries have opened their doors to tourism (although some have closed them again due to the increase in the number of COVID-19 cases after tourism opened), others are improving to prepare for tourism recovery in various forms, such as preparing the implementation of health protocols in the tourism sector, assistance to workers and industry, incentives for tourists, domestic and regional tourism promotion activities, tourism campaigns that implement strict health protocols, and so on. However, in Indonesia, the COVID-19 pandemic has also hit the tourism sector hard. For example, the number of foreign tourists in the January-August period dropped dramatically

by 68.17% compared to 2019 (Kedia & Lahiri, 2007; Tuten & Urban, 2001). Many tourism workers experienced layoffs, as well as many tourism service sector businesses that went bankrupt. On the other hand, this pandemic reflects the euphoria of massive tourism development in the past few years (Hakim et al. (2020), and how dangerous it is to depend on this vulnerable sector (Fletcher et al., 2020).

Private and community participation in tourism activities is a necessity; Generally, the government has restrictions on providing public goods and services, including tourism activities. Pitana & Diarta (2009), defines the limitation that along with the increasing demand for public services and the increasingly limited capacity of the government bureaucracy, private and public participation in public services becomes necessary. The dominance of the government bureaucracy in various aspects of people's lives is beginning to be doubted. Strengthening the flow of democratization increases the need to involve the community and actors outside the government bureaucracy in the management of public services. Along with increasing service aspirations, public participation in public service delivery has become a necessity, not just a need (Batt & Purchase, 2004; Vachon & Klassen, 2008).

Efforts to realize good governance in the tourism sector are certainly not easy because the three pillars of government do not have equal capacity and position. According to Haryono (2012), a collaboration between the government and the private sector/community has only been limited to collaboration between workers and non-governmental organizations such as suppliers or contractors. This type of cooperation is nothing more than a sale and purchase transaction of goods and services between the government as the principal and the private sector or the public sector as an intermediary. The cooperation is only short-term with a limited intensity of the relationship specified in the contractual clause (Yoon et al., 2001; Tosun, 2006).

The problems raised by Haryono certainly have given birth to new ideas to develop concepts that can solve these problems. The new concept is partnership-based governance, which some experts refer to as a concept in the form of public administration as partnership governance (Webb & Pule (2002); Mu et al. (2011); Mahmudi (2007)). Singkawang City partnership efforts are normatively stated in government policies through West Kalimantan Provincial Regulation Number 3 of 2018 concerning the Master Plan for Regional Tourism Development 2017-2032, especially in Article 3 letter (a), which stipulates that the control of tourism development in the province of West Kalimantan through the synergy carried out by the government, the community, and the business world. Then, in the direction of tourism policy in Article 9 letter (c), it is stated that the development of tourism marketing partnerships is realized by developing integrated, synergistic, sustainable, and sustainable marketing partnerships (Suh et al., 2012; Chathoth & Olsen, 2003).

The Singkawang City Government also has the Singkawang City Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2013 concerning the Implementation of Tourism Article 25 paragraph 1, which emphasizes that the Regional Government is obliged to create a conducive climate for the development of tourism businesses which includes opening up equal opportunities in business, facilitating, and providing legal certainty. In 2020, investment growth in Singkawang City was recorded to reach 917.33 billion rupiahs. However, the tourism sector is not a business sector that gets a significant investment. The four highest business sectors that received significant investments were human and social health activities, the manufacturing industry sector, the agriculture, forestry, and fishery sectors, and the wholesale, retail, repair, and maintenance of cars and motorcycle (Christou et al., 2018; Tkaczynski et al., 2009). The Singkawang City tourism sector can receive significant investment because the Kijing Port supports it as the entry point for goods to the surrounding area, the availability of electricity, good quality roads, and the Singkawang Airport development plan.

Partnership problems in tourism governance also occur in Samarinda City. Putra (2013), found that partnerships between stakeholders consisting of local governments, the tourism industry, and community tourism have not produced good synergies. Local governments still dominate most of the partnerships built. Based on the problems described above, it can be concluded that there is still a gap between normative reality (expectations) and empirical reality. On the one hand, the Government of Singkawang City has developed a partnership policy with the private sector and the community, characterized by sharing benefits and risks and collecting resources. Meanwhile, the Singkawang City Government still faces obstacles because the previous cooperation was only limited to contractual cooperation (Atoev, 2021; Fathoni & Lanrong, 2021).

Methods

This research begins by formulating practical problems in the administration of government affairs, especially in tourism. Then this research explores various theories. It is designed by experts and empirical facts from research in various countries. The concept of government as an innovative paradigm in government science is the theoretical basis to explain this phenomenon. This study examines field data by conducting studies on the instruments that have

been prepared. This study uses a theoretical framework previously used to analyze and interpret empirical data or knowledge collected in the field to obtain new concepts. This research will focus on:

- Managing the provision of partnership-based tourism facilities.
- The partnership pattern that has been implemented so far between the government and the private sector, and the method used in this research is qualitative research because this method allows a broad explanation of the data obtained to be provided without using statistical techniques.

The data collection technique chosen is the use of documentation and interviews. Data collection through the documentation method is carried out by searching for various documents and files of government agencies, especially the Tourism Office, Bappeda, and the Legal Section of the Regional Secretariat related to the management of tourist facilities. This documentation shows that some tourism objects are operated through partnerships, and at the same time, the rules of the game are established between the government, the private sector, and the community.

Results and Discussion

The partnership involves both parties sharing resources, risks, responsibilities, and benefits. Due to this type of collaboration, the partnership is directed towards long-term interests because it requires resilience and a relatively high level of interaction between the two parties (Dwiyanto, 2018). The concept of partnership which shows the relationship between government and non-government actors produces a different partnership pattern. Savas (1999), developed the concept of an association pattern where the relationship between the government, the private sector, and the community can be seen. Savas develops a partnership pattern in providing services based on the distribution of types of goods or services, including pure public goods, pure private goods, tool goods, and collective goods. There are types of goods or services that the government can only provide, some that the community can fully manage, and there are also mixed types, namely goods or services, which are collaborative tools and goods.

The concept of governance in tourism has led to partnerships between the government and the private sector and has proven to provide practical improvements in tourism management. Meanwhile, the practice of government-community cooperation in implementing tourism has also been going on for a long time. Several studies have been conducted, such as Studi by Bramwell & Lane (2003), research on partnerships and regional tourism development in Brazil. This research shows that tourism development through partnerships can be more efficient and have high community sustainability. Rahayuningsih (2014), in Malang City shows that the joint efforts of the government and the community in organizing tourism events are very effective, and community participation is relatively high for the success of Malang Tempo Doeloe. Studies in Northern Cyprus by Alipour et al. (2011), published in the Journal of Sustainable Development with the title Governance as Catalyst to Sustainable Tourism Development: Evidence from North Cyprus leads to the conclusion that sustainable tourism planning cannot be implemented effectively if the institution does not restructure organizational behavior in the form of a policy process to increase close collaboration with stakeholders (tourism industry and society). Research conducted in Spain by Zapata & Hall (2019), analyzes the balance between effectiveness and legitimacy in partnerships between the government and the private sector. In this study, it was found that cooperation that has high legitimacy is more effective in its implementation.

Government and community partnerships in the Cap Go Meh festival

The form of partnership between the government and the community can be seen in activities or events organized by the Singkawang City Government, which is held every year, namely the Cap Go Meh Festival. This festival is an attraction that embodies the acculturation of the major ethnic groups in Singkawang City. This festival later became the main attraction of Singkawang City as a cultural tourism destination. The highlight of the Cap Go Meh celebration in Singkawang City in 2019. It was recorded that there were 76,964 tourists, both domestic and foreign, who came to witness one of Indonesia's mainstay events which were included in the 100 Calendar of Events for Wonderful Indonesia 2019. That number increased from 2018, which was only around 70,000 tourists. Most tourists come from Taiwan, Singapore, Australia, Malaysia, Hong Kong, Macau, Thailand, and the Philippines. According to Ismayanti (2010), tourist receiving communities can be directly and actively involved in the world of tourism, for example, as temporary or permanent employees in the tourism service provider industry such as; travel agencies (travel agencies), hotels, villas, bungalows, restaurants, transportation and so on. Therefore, the fame of cultural tourism owned by Singkawang City is expected to boost other potential tourism attractions, such as nature tourism and culinary tourism.

Public-private partnership

Tourist destinations in Singkawang City provide opportunities for entrepreneurs to contribute to supporting tourism business activities. One hundred eighty-six tourism facilities in the Singkawang City Tourism, and Sports Youth Office issued a tourism business registration certificate (TDUP). Even though, in reality, there are still some tourism businesses that do not yet have a tourism business registration mark, the government comes to these businesses to socialize and provide information so that they immediately have a tourism business registration mark. From the results of the research that has been carried out in the management of Pasir Panjang Beach by PT Palapa Wahyu Group Singkawang, there is a collaboration with the private sector by the Build-Operate-Transfer (BOT) concept, and the Singkawang City Government provides Building Use Rights (HGB) on land management rights (HPL) for 30 years to PT Palapa Wahyu Group Singkawang. The private sector has the authority to operate the facility and earn income from ticket entry according to the agreement, and after the operational period ends, the facility is handed back to the Singkawang City Government.

During this collaboration, the tenant is responsible for order, cleanliness, and security in coordination with related parties. This collaboration aims to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of services to tourists visiting Pasir Panjang Beach. Based on the mutualistic partnership model, the Singkawang City Government and the private sector uses the principle of mutual help values (cooperation, unity, joint action, solidarity). These values are realized through joint action, cooperation, and solidarity to implement the unification of the vision and mission in the development and management of tourism that can improve the community's welfare around Pasir Panjang Beach. By the vision and mission and the mutual agreement between the Singkawang City Government and the private sector in tourism management at Pasir Panjang Beach, the model applied is more directed towards a mutualistic partnership in which there are essential aspects, namely to provide mutual benefits and mutual benefits so that they will be able to achieve their goals. More optimal. However, in reality, the existing human resources are still lacking and need to be improved by providing training that will work by established procedures.

Improving tourism marketing and services is the mission of the Singkawang City Government. Dissemination of information about tourism objects through promotional activities is one of the essential activities in tourism development. Promotional activities have activities around tourism destination cooperation, fostering stakeholders in the development of tourism information systems, and implementing flagship tourism branding to be promoted nationally and internationally. In the implementation of this partnership, there are several supporting factors such as The characteristics and location of Pasir Panjang Beach, which is at the entrance of Singkawang City from Pontianak City and crossed by the main provincial route, is the main supporting factor as an alternative for motorists who cross it as a resting place as well as a tourist destination. Pasir Panjang Beach is one of the recreational areas with a large fishing area and various other facilities, so that this tourist area is very suitable to be used as a means of entertainment and recreation with family.

Problems that occur in the development and management of Pasir Panjang Beach. in partnerships between the private sector and the community is caused by several things, among others: The lack of relevance between the need for a competent workforce and the main tasks and functions of the organization is one of the problems; however, efforts to improve the quality of human resources have been carried out gradually and continuously. This is an optimal effort to provide better services to the community to meet performance targets. Information about tourism in Singkawang City is still not comprehensive in the scope of tourism outside the region. Information or promotions that are carried out are only limited to local communities so that many tourists do not know the types of tourism in Singkawang City. Improvements are needed in providing access to information through internet media and collaborating with television and radio stations so that the wider community can know and be interested in visiting tourism in Singkawang City.

This study proposes a partnership model formulated by the Research Team, which develops the quadruple helix model in building partnerships for tourism development and management in Singkawang City. The adaptation of the quadruple helix concept in tourism development needs to involve five parties. The elements of partnership referred to in this study are the government, academia, the private sector/business people, the community or the community, and the mass media. These elements are further elaborated or further detailed as follows:

- **Government**

The government organization, namely the bureaucracy, is seen as the most responsible administrative agent in policy implementation. One of the backward mapping components that support implementation is the implementing structure (Elmore, 1979). In both developed and developing countries. The great authority on the bureaucracy to fully control the "area" of policy implementation in its area of operation due to the legislature's mandate (Yuningsih et al., 2019). Local government bureaucracies that are expected to be

involved in the Penta helix model of tourism development in Singkawang City Regency are the Regional Technical Service or Institution that has a role in tourism, culture, and art affairs; tourism development planning arranged in the Strategic Plan (Renstra); providers of access and infrastructure related to tourism; facilitate industry and trade; facilitate agriculture; facilitate investment and one-stop integrated services; enforcing regulations and controlling the area around the tourist attraction. Bureaucracy is the leading actor in the implementation of public policy, but in the implementation of policies, another actor is also involved in the legislature. The legislature is involved in implementation when it determines various specific regulations and carries out the roles of legislation, budgeting, and controlling.

- **Academics**
In the study of [Halibas e al. \(2017\)](#), intellectual capacity is to shape society by providing the required skilled labor so that the knowledge economy can develop. In addition, it prepares students to think critically and develop talents and produce knowledge and skills that are innovative, enterprising, and entrepreneurial. Innovation is the keyword in the involvement of academics in disseminating information and applying technology, entrepreneurship through beneficial collaborations and partnerships between academia, government, business, community, and mass media. The involvement of universities in Singkawang City contributes to the advancement of tourism and local socio-economics.
- **Private/Business**
The number of tourist attractions in Singkawang City is an opportunity for the community to move the regional economy by becoming a businessman/entrepreneur. Business in the tourism sector is quite busy; social media influences this in promoting existing tourist destinations. Thus providing opportunities for the community to do business in the tourism sector. Business products that can be developed in this case are services provided to consumers, such as tourism objects as the main product offered; transportation (tour & travel, airline ticket providers, vehicle rental/transportation providers); tour guides (business owners can employ people around tourist objects to become tour guides); accommodation or lodging; and culinary businesses, as well as services or products that are tailored to the needs and desires of customers.
- **Community**
Communities in this study are defined as local communities in the broadest sense, as well as customary law communities as owners of customary rights, as well as groups formed such as regional arts councils, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), or groups based on interests or hobbies, which aim to explore or promote tourism in the area. The community is one of the stakeholders, has a role in tourism development. The role of the community, starting from planning to implementing tourism development in the region. The concept of Community-Based Tourism (CBT) tries to explain the role of the community in tourism, which is placed as the main actor through empowerment so that the priority of tourism benefits is allocated as much as possible for the welfare of the local community. The inseparable relationship between customary law communities in West Kalimantan Province and natural resources, as a means in order to maintain and maintain life and cultural identity as a spiritual aspect, source of economic life, and other life development, further emphasizes the concept of tourism development based on local wisdom in the Regency. Singkawang City. Local wisdom as a cultural advantage of the local community is related to geographical conditions in a broad sense and as a product of past cultures. The value system that has been running in cultural and community life forms a pattern that may be biased or even completely lost in the life process of the local community. In order for the system of cultural values and all aspects contained in the form of local or other wisdom to be preserved, then all elements of both the government, the community, the private sector always strive to maintain these cultural values ([Marturbongs et al., 2019](#)).
- **Mass Media**
One of the actors in tourism development is the mass media. Mass media is a means of policy socialization and communication and link between the government and society ([Howlett & Rayner, 1995](#)). The mass media in today's modern society continues to experience rapid development. Initially, we only knew that mass media was divided between print media such as newspapers, magazines, print media, and electronic media in television and radio broadcasts. Meanwhile, nowadays, along with the development of technology and the internet, new media have emerged, namely social media such as; Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, YouTube, and more. The emergence of new media that continues to grow is helpful for social interactions between humans that are digital, networked, and computerized as an effect of sophistication in technology, information, and communication ([Kurnia, 2005](#)). Social interactions that are quickly established in communicating through social networks such as Facebook, Instagram, YouTube, Twitter, and others prove that modern communication is not hindered by distance and time. The ability of the mass media to

disseminate information without being limited by the dimensions of space and time is utilized in the tourism sector. The region continues to promote tourism objects that can attract the interest of tourism connoisseurs themselves, be it natural tourism, cultural tourism, spiritual tourism, and other types of tourism. With the ease of accessing social media by anyone, anytime and anywhere, people are starting to leave conventional promotional methods such as print and electronic media and switch to social media, which is considered adequate.

Conclusion and Recommendation

The number of associations and organizations engaged in tourism, among others, such as the Indonesia Marketing Association (IMA), the Indonesian Hotel and Restaurant Association (PHRI), and the Indonesian Tour Guides Association (HPI) in Singkawang City that has not synergized with the Singkawang City government work program thus hampering development public-private partnerships (PPP). This is due to differences in goals and interests that hinder the government's efforts to market tourism. Other problems can also be seen from the ineffectiveness of the MoUs on tourism marketing cooperation that has been agreed between the government and associations, as well as organizations that are still not running well. The MoU-MoU on cooperation in tourism marketing that has been stated has not been implemented optimally; the commitment of the industry and associations contained in the MoU for cooperation is still within the document limits because, in reality, there are many collaborations; that have not been appropriately implemented. The tourism business partnership between the large-scale tourism industry and the micro, small and medium scale tourism economy businesses are still not running optimally. The development of business partnerships is intended so that the opportunities and benefits of developing tourism can be enjoyed by all parties in various types and scales of business.

References

- Alipour, H., Vaziri, R. K., & Ligay, E. (2011). Governance as catalyst to sustainable tourism development: Evidence from North Cyprus. *Journal of Sustainable Development*, 4(5), 32.
- Atoev, T. A. (2021). Bilateral and institutional partnership between Georgia and the United States: a retrospective analysis. *International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(2), 245-248. <https://doi.org/10.31295/ijss.v4n2.1721>
- Batt, P. J., & Purchase, S. (2004). Managing collaboration within networks and relationships. *Industrial marketing management*, 33(3), 169-174. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indmarman.2003.11.004>
- Bramwell, B., & Lane, B. (Eds.). (2003). *Tourism collaboration and partnerships: Politics, practice and sustainability* (Vol. 2). Channel View Publications.
- Chathoth, P. K., & Olsen, M. D. (2003). Strategic alliances: a hospitality industry perspective. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 22(4), 419-434. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2003.07.001>
- Christou, P., Farmaki, A., & Evangelou, G. (2018). Nurturing nostalgia?: A response from rural tourism stakeholders. *Tourism Management*, 69, 42-51. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2018.05.010>
- Dwiyanto, A. (2018). *Manajemen Pelayanan Publik: Peduli Inklusif Dan Kolaborasi*. UGM PRESS.
- Elmore, R. F. (1979). Backward mapping: Implementation research and policy decisions. *Political science quarterly*, 94(4), 601-616.
- Fathoni, A., & Lanrong, Y. (2021). Transportation policy toward sustainable tourism development: Province of East Java, Indonesia. *International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(1), 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.31295/ijss.v4n1.350>
- Fletcher, R., Murray, I., Blázquez-Salom, M., & Asunción, B. R. (2020). Tourism, degrowth, and the COVID-19 Crisis. *Political Ecology Network*, 24.
- Gössling, S., Scott, D., & Hall, C. M. (2020). Pandemics, tourism and global change: a rapid assessment of COVID-19. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 29(1), 1-20.
- Hakim, A. A., Kellish, A. S., Atabek, U., Spitz, F. R., & Hong, Y. K. (2020). Implications for the use of telehealth in surgical patients during the COVID-19 pandemic. *The American Journal of Surgery*, 220(1), 48-49.
- Halibas, A. S., Sibayan, R. O., & Maata, R. L. R. (2017). THE PENTA HELIX MODEL OF INNOVATION IN OMAN: AN HEI PERSPECTIVE. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Information, Knowledge & Management*, 12.
- Haryono, N. (2012). Jejaring untuk membangun kolaborasi sektor publik. *Jurnal Jejaring Administrasi Publik*, 4(1), 47-53.
- Howlett, M., & Rayner, J. (1995). Do ideas matter? Policy network configurations and resistance to policy change in the Canadian forest sector. *Canadian public administration*, 38(3), 382-410.
- Ismayanti, I. (2010). Pengantar pariwisata. *PT Gramedia Widiasarana*.
- Kedia, B. L., & Lahiri, S. (2007). International outsourcing of services: A partnership model. *Journal of International Management*, 13(1), 22-37. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intman.2006.09.006>

- Kurnia, S. S. (2005). *Jurnalisme kontemporer*. Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- Mahmudi, M. (2007). Kemitraan Pemerintah Daerah dan Efektivitas Pelayanan Publik. *Sinergi: Kajian Bisnis dan Manajemen*, 9(1).
- Maturbongs, E., Suwitri, S., KISMARTINI, K., & Purnaweni, H. (2019). Internalization of Value System in Mineral Materials Management Policies Instead of Metal And Rocks in Merauke District. *Prizren Social Science Journal*, 3(2), 32-42.
- Mu, R., De Jong, M., & Koppenjan, J. (2011). The rise and fall of Public–Private Partnerships in China: a path-dependent approach. *Journal of transport geography*, 19(4), 794-806.
- Pitana, I., & Diarta, I. (2009). Pengantar ilmu pariwisata.
- Putra, A. S. (2013). Pola Kemitraan Pariwisata Dalam Manajemen Atraksi Desa Wisata Pampang Kota Samarinda. *Jurnal Nasional Pariwisata*, 5(3), 189-200.
- Rahayuningsih, W. (2014). Cultural Heritage, Sebagai Media Pengembangan Sektor Pariwisata dan Ekonomi Kreatif. *LORONG: Media Pengkajian Sosial Budaya*, 3(2).
- Savas, E. S., & Savas, E. S. (2000). Privatization and public-private partnerships.
- Suh, E., West, J. J., & Shin, J. (2012). Important competency requirements for managers in the hospitality industry. *Journal of hospitality, leisure, sport & tourism education*, 11(2), 101-112. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhlste.2012.02.005>
- Tkaczynski, A., Rundle-Thiele, S. R., & Beaumont, N. (2009). Segmentation: A tourism stakeholder view. *Tourism management*, 30(2), 169-175.
- Tosun, C. (2006). Expected nature of community participation in tourism development. *Tourism management*, 27(3), 493-504. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2004.12.004>
- Tuten, T. L., & Urban, D. J. (2001). An expanded model of business-to-business partnership formation and success. *Industrial marketing management*, 30(2), 149-164. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0019-8501\(00\)00140-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0019-8501(00)00140-1)
- Vachon, S., & Klassen, R. D. (2008). Environmental management and manufacturing performance: The role of collaboration in the supply chain. *International journal of production economics*, 111(2), 299-315. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpe.2006.11.030>
- Webb, R., & Pulle, B. (2002). *Public private partnerships: An introduction*. Department of the Parliamentary Library.
- Yoon, Y., Gursoy, D., & Chen, J. S. (2001). Validating a tourism development theory with structural equation modeling. *Tourism management*, 22(4), 363-372. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0261-5177\(00\)00062-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0261-5177(00)00062-5)
- Yuningsih, T., Darmi, T., & Sulandari, S. (2019). Model pentahelik dalam pengembangan pariwisata di Kota Semarang. *JPSI (Journal of Public Sector Innovations)*, 3(2), 84-93.
- Zapata Campos, M. J., & Hall, C. M. (2019). Transformative collaboration: knocking down taboos, challenging normative associations. *Journal of Policy Research in Tourism, Leisure and Events*, 11(sup1), s13-s18.