



## **Bureaucracy Conflicts in Border Areas (Study on Conflict between Civilian State Apparatus and Regent in Morotai Island Regency)**



**Fandi Hi. Latief**<sup>a</sup>  
**Rasid Pora**<sup>b</sup>  
**Sri Ka'abah**<sup>c</sup>  
**Marno Wance**<sup>d</sup>

---

### **Article history:**

**Submitted:** 27 January 2021  
**Revised:** 18 February 2021  
**Accepted:** 09 March 2021

---

### **Keywords:**

*conflict;*  
*political will;*  
*regional head;*  
*state civil apparatus;*

---

### **Abstract**

Regional bureaucratic conflicts are often caused by regional heads' failure to express the concept of regional bureaucratic development and appear to be political, followed by the regional authorities' egocentrism, causing conflicts for the provincial government's technical implementers (in this case, Civilian State Apparatus. This series of matches has drained energy, costs, and energy for Civilian State Apparatus has been highlighted so that the spirit of bureaucratic reform is highlighted not running optimally. The results of the study show that the conflict begins with the regional head's policy regarding a system of rotation/transfer of positions that are not based on employment regulations, the application of immeasurable reward and punishment, the obligation to take credit, buy a house, and buy a vehicle for state civil apparatus with guaranteed Regional Performance Allowances. Following the position (not having a legal basis) Decree of Promotion for state civil apparatus as much as 611 (3 (three periods of promotion) and the imposition of sanctions for the Acting Regional Secretary of Morotai Island Regency in the form of a Warning Letter for not receiving allowances until an unspecified time limit.

*International research journal of management, IT and social sciences* © 2021.  
*This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license*  
*(<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).*

---

### **Corresponding author:**

Marno Wance,  
Universitas Pattimura, Indonesia  
Email address: [marno.wance@fisip.unpatti.ac.id](mailto:marno.wance@fisip.unpatti.ac.id)

---

<sup>a</sup> Universitas Pasifik Morotai, Indonesia. Email: [fandi.latief.09@gmail.com](mailto:fandi.latief.09@gmail.com)

<sup>b</sup> Universitas Muhammadiyah Maluku Utara, Indonesia. Email: [rasidpora@yahoo.co.id](mailto:rasidpora@yahoo.co.id)

<sup>c</sup> Universitas Pasifik Morotai, Indonesia. Email: [bah123@gmail.com](mailto:bah123@gmail.com)

<sup>d</sup> Universitas Pattimura, Indonesia.

## 1 Introduction

In the bureaucracy, conflicts often occur due to disagreements between groups and individuals, different perceptions, and the issue of the interests of public officials. Conflicts arise from imbalances in these relationships, such as imbalances in social status, wealth, access to resources, and imbalances in power, resulting in various problems such as discrimination, unemployment, poverty, and crime oppression. In line with this, according to Hardjana, conflict occurs when there is a conflict of interest. In another formula, it can be stated that conflict occurs when parties feel they are being mistreated or when the party behaves in touching the "points of anger" of another party. In other words, differences in interests due to vertical and horizontal plurality are necessary conditions for conflict to arise. However, differences in interests are not sufficient conditions to cause conflict, conflict occurs because there are conditions that precede conflict, and conditions it is a source of conflict (Muspawi, 2014; Dalimunthe, 2016; Heridiansyah, 2014; Sopandi, 2019; Suryanata & Pemayun, 2018).

In its development, Morotai Island Regency as a border area expanded through Law Number 53 of 2008, has experienced ups and downs in the implementation of the bureaucratic system, even to the point of prolonged conflicts. This is shown by, after the inauguration of the elected Regent Benny-Arun as the elected Regent and Deputy Regent for the 2017-2022 period, the Regent implemented several policies that generated protests and criticism, especially among the State Civil Service.

The dynamics of the State Civil Service conflict are illustrated by the existence of a policy of rotation/transfer of positions. It is not based on employment regulations, indicated by the mutation of both the leadership and all staff in the Public Relations and Protocol Section of the Regional Secretariat to sub-district Morotai Jaya, the application of immeasurable reward and punishment, The obligation to take credit, buy a house, and buy a vehicle for civil servants with guaranteed Regional Performance Allowance according to their position (having no legal basis), thus causing many civil servants to have problems with the bank because experiencing bad credit if at any time they lose their position, as well as 611 unsigned letters of promotion for State Civil Service the period October 2017-October 2018. (Three times the promotion period).

The conflict became more and more inevitable when there was a sanction for the Acting Regional Secretary of Morotai Island Regency in the form of a Second Warning Letter which contained Acting. The Regional Secretary did not receive the allowance until an unspecified time limit (Roth & Nigh, 1992; Sahide & Giessen, 2015). The implication of implementing this unpopular policy led to a reaction from the State Civil Service, which led to mass upheaval from the public and employees in the form of demonstrations, dismissal of government offices, and follow-up state civil apparatus in the form of complaints to the State Civil Apparatus Commission (Barua et al., 2013; Giessen et al., 2014; Hedges, 2002). State Civil Apparatus Commission in Manado and the Ministry of Home Affairs. State civil apparatus carried out the demonstration action, then followed up and responded by the Ministry of Home Affairs's Team to resolve employment problems in Morotai.

The mediation led to state civil apparatus changes to be highlighted, including the signing of 611 Decrees of Promotion and Implementation of government employees mutations and Dismissal of Structural Position Echelon II, III, and IV by Acting. Regional Secretary of the District. Morotai Island. However, after the Ministry of Home Affairs Team's presence, there was criticism and conflict from the state civil apparatus mortal, so that the state civil apparatus who felt aggrieved and followed up again in the form of reporting to State Civil Apparatus Commission Manado. The reporting of state civil apparatus to State Civil Apparatus Commission is fundamental, considering Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus, which explains that the State Civil Apparatus Commission functions to oversee the implementation of basic norms, code of ethics, and code of conduct of state civil apparatus, as well as the implementation of the Merit System in policy and management. State Civil Service in Government Agencies and must maintain the neutrality of State Civil Service Employees and supervise the state civil apparatus professional development for further reporting to the President (Law 5 of 2014).

The chronology of the conflict above is a sequence of events which is a tool used to show the history of a conflict based on a list of the time it occurred (year, month/day, according to the scale), which is displayed sequentially (Fisher et al., 2000; Aslan, 2019). This tool is a "starting point" in understanding and uncovering conflict because it can identify the various parties' interpretations of an event. This interpretation can come from one party or another party that will later be used to analyze the Bureaucratic conflict phenomenon in the Border Area.

## 2 Materials and Methods

This research uses descriptive qualitative research, namely research that describes and describes an event to draw general conclusions. According to Moleong, qualitative descriptive research is a problem-solving procedure investigated by describing and describing the current situation based on the facts as they are (Meleong, 2008; Cassell et al., 2017; Flick, 2013; Willig & Rogers, 2017; Berg, 2001). The approach used in this research is descriptive research, which aims to present a general description of the problem of the situation and social relations from the existence of bureaucratic conflicts and mediation by the regional head.

Data collection techniques carried out by researchers in this study were divided into two data in primary data and supporting data. This study's primary data were interviews with key informants, both perpetrators, and victims of the conflict. Data analysis techniques used in this research are; (1) data collection, namely data obtained from research sources that are still raw and have not been processed by researchers, (2) data reduction by making abstractions to make a summary to select data so that the data can be adjusted to the one being studied, (3) Identification and Category, in this section the researcher identifies and categorizes according to the formulation of the research problem. This is also done by codifying the data and information obtained through observation, interviews, documentation, and (4) writing conclusions or verification, namely formulating conclusions in detail. In this case, after being processed, some of the best alternatives are taken or used as material for conveying information and making conclusions.

## 3 Results and Discussions

### 3.1 *The Beginning of the State Civil Service Conflict in Morotai Island Regency*

This conflict arose from the beginning of the Regent and Deputy Regent's inauguration for the 2017-2022 Period. After taking office, the Regent of Morotai Island was judged arrogant by the State Civil Service, who conflicted with Morotai Island's Regent. Because it is considered that the regent issued several policies that are not populist and fair for State Civil Service, it is considered that several policies make internal bureaucratic noise. Imagine, since the beginning of his term of office, the regent has issued policies: the provision of rewards and punishments that have not been appropriately measured, apply working hours, and transfer positions that do not consider the laws and regulations that apply to them. State civil apparatus and the obligation to take credit for State Civil Service with guaranteed performance allowances (Interview with Mr. M. Mustafa Lasidji on March 1, 2021).

To achieve the successful goal of bureaucratic reform within the Morotai island district government, one of the policies that must be taken is rewording and punishment to work together and synergize to become honest policy feedback in making decisions on the apparatus. Civil Servant in Morotai Island Regency. Prizes (reward) are principally the work achievements made by State civil apparatus or government agencies so that regional heads give prizes to spur and improve their employees' performance. However, in practice, there is an unbalanced application of reward and punishment policies. This is evident from the existence of 26 Regional Apparatus Organizations leadership, and staff of the Regional Apparatus Organizations is executed without any basis for deciding the policy.

After implementing reward and punishment for State Civil Service, the regent as the regional head then applied demotion considerations for State civil apparatus in Morotai Island Regency by issuing a policy of implementing large-scale employee mutations without considering elements of rank and position State Civil Service. It is alleged that the mutation process was caused by the like and disliked factor without any process being followed based on existing regulations. Even mutations in the Public Relations and Protocol sections occur not because there is a purpose of refreshing. However, if there are other factors, it should be that if there is an error made, the Regional Head's Policy through regional civil service agency Morotai gives SP-I, SP-II after that it will be prosecuted, this is not carried out, but mutations were immediately held. Strange mutations were carried out simultaneously, starting from all employees, starting from the leadership to all staff (Interview with Mr. Kalbi Rasid as regional civil service agency Morotai on December 17, 2020).

Furthermore, in the rank process for State Civil Service, there were around 611 State Civil Service as whose ranks were not signed (equivalent to 3 periods for proposing ranks) without any basis for the regional head not to sign the rank so that the impression should be given to civil servants who have good work performance does not have the potential to earn an award. Even though rank is an award given by the State to State Civil Service who has good work performance in their respective work environment (Law Number 5 of 2014) so that this phenomenon causes unrest for

State Civil Service in their career development, that means that the policy is not populist towards employee career development, so it seems controversial and creates conflict.

Instead of improving the situation, there was an impression of arrogance from the regional head in determining career development for State Civil Service, even the conflict heated up when in November 2019. The regent took a policy to replace Regional Secretary officials who were deemed unable to carry out their duties properly so that the concerned was given sanctions in the form of warning letter Number 862.1 / 308 / SP / XI / 2018, which states that temporary officials the Regional Secretary did not receive the allowance until an indefinite time limit. (Interview with Mr. Muh. Kharie and confirmed by the Official Report of state civil apparatus reporting to State Civil Apparatus Commission in Jakarta).

### *3.2 State Civil Apparatus Goes Down the Road (Demonstration)*

In the chain of command, each position and job responsibilities are clearly described in the organization. This organization also has strict rules and procedures, so it tends to be less flexible. Another characteristic is that there is usually a delegation of authority that must be carried out under the power hierarchy. As the Head of Government in the Regions, the Regional Secretary also experienced the Regent's decision, so that with his authority, the Acting Regional Secretary held a meeting to ensure justice for State Civil Service in Morotai Island Regency. The discussion material regarding the Regent's policy is considered burdensome for civil servants and the replacement of Acting. The Regional Secretary and Employee Movements, namely to immediately consolidate first then move, then immediately make an inventory of the heads of offices who agree and which services do not agree with the movement. So from the meeting, it was agreed that there would be a road movement (demonstration) as part of the expression of the State Civil Service's disappointment with the Regent. After the meeting, it was also followed by community participants who felt the effects of non-populist policies; even direction efforts were made to consolidate the entire community in Morotai Island Regency, while at the same time the community had family or relatives working in government agencies.

Furthermore, civil servants' involvement in the demonstration on November 19, 2018, was also caused by Mr. Alexander Wermasubun as Assistant II for General Administration and office-man. In a statement leaflet issued by the United Morotai Community Coalition, this was what triggered a spontaneous reaction by all civil servants, including Assistant and Expert Staff to the Regent and Regional Apparatus Organizations leadership who at that time attended the morning rally at the Regent's office, so that they consciously reacted and responded to the demonstration

### *3.3 Disgrace Post-Demonstration Mediation Process*

After the demonstration, which was held on November 19, 2019, then at the Regional Secretary's residence, a meeting was held, which was chaired directly by the Acting. Regional Secretary and was attended by several Regional Apparatus Organizations leaders by giving directions to all officials present, as for the directions given directly by the temporary officials the Regional Secretary of Morotai Island Regency, namely;

- 1) Each Regional Apparatus Organizations leader controls his staff to stop taking to the streets because we already know the content of the demands, including being able to sort out which ones are in the interests of state civil apparatus because the demonstration also involved elements outside the State Civil Service;
- 2) The demonstration carried out by state civil apparatus occurred spontaneously to coincide with the completion of a joint rally at the Regent's office, because the content of the demonstration was related to the problems faced by state civil apparatus, so because they felt the same fate, finally all State Civil Service joined together to participate in the demonstration;
- 3) Ensure also that State Civil Service must be protected because what is being voiced is in our common interest. Therefore all State Civil Service are urged not to be afraid because someone is already credit or something happens after the demonstration.

State civil apparatus carried out the demonstration action, then followed up and responded by the Ministry of Home Affairs Team to resolve employment problems. Several things were done in January 2019 by the Regional Government after the Ministry of Home Affairs Team visited the District. Morotai Island, namely:

Table 1  
The visit of the Minister of Home Affairs Team and its statement

Things Done	Information
Signed 611 Decree for Civilian State Apparatus Promotion by the Regent of Morotai Island for 3 (three) times the Promotion Period (October 2017-October 2018)	Since January 4, 2019, it has been carried out in waves at the Headquarters of the Regent of Morotai Island
The issuance of several Regent Regulations to support the Resolution of Personnel Problems in the District Government Environment. Morotai Island.	One of the Regent Regulations concerning the Delegation of Part of the Authority of the Regent to the Regional Secretary.
The existence of Civil Servant Movements and Dismissal of Structural Position Echelon II, III, and IV by Acting. Regional Secretary of the District. Morotai Island	Implemented since January 7, 2019, approximately 4 Echelon II.b Officers, 20 Echelon III.a and III.b Officers and 40 Echelon IV Officials and Staff

Source: Minutes of the Meeting of the Minister of Home Affairs and Civilian State Apparatus Morotai Team

Based on the table above, it can be seen that after the action carried out by state civil apparatus employees, in the end, the Regent of Morotai Island signed a 611 decree promotion and improved regulations regarding reward and punishment for Civilian State Apparatus as part of Civilian State Apparatus demands that must be realized. However, this policy's implementation seems half-hearted because there are still some civil servants who have been transferred to the sub-districts. Until now, the Decree of Promotion is not signed by the Regent, and even the Regent also gives an excuse if almost all civil servants carry out the demonstration, become the legal basis for the transfer and dismissal of civil servants from structural positions Echelon II, III and IV. To support steps to resolve employment problems. So that from this matter, the Regent of Morotai Island issued several supporting regulations as shown in the table below:

Table 2  
The regulations support the implementation of bureaucratic reform

Regulation / decision	Information
Morotai Island Regent Regulation Number 37 of 2018 concerning Bureaucratic Reform and Enforcement of Civilian State Apparatus Discipline in the District Government Environment Morotai Island;	Promulgated on February 5, 2018;
Morotai Island Regent Regulation Number 01 of 2019 Concerning the Delegation of Part of the Authority of the Regent to the Regional Secretary regarding the Signing of Decree on Transfer, Appointment and Dismissal of Civilian State Apparatus;	Promulgated on February 4, 2018;
Morotai Island Regent Regulation Number 04 of 2019 concerning Bureaucratic Reform and Enforcement of Civilian State Apparatus Discipline in the District Government Environment. Morotai Island;	Promulgated on February 5 2018;
Decree of the Regent of Morotai Island, Number: 863/268 / KPTS / PM / 2018, concerning the Establishment of the state civil apparatus Discipline Enforcement Bureaucratic Reform Team for the District. Morotai Island;	Promulgated on February 3, 2018;
Decree of the Regent of Morotai Island, Number: 954/41 / KPTS / PM / 2019, concerning the Determination of the Amount of Regional Performance Allowances at the Office of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, District Morotai Island;	Promulgated on February 4, 2018;
Decree of the Regent of Morotai Island, Number: 954/47 / KPTS / PM / 2019, concerning the Determination of the Amount of Regional Performance Allowances at the Regional Secretariat of District Morotai Island;	Promulgated on February 4, 2018;
Decree of the Regent of Morotai Island, Number: 954/63 / KPTS / PM / 2019, concerning the Determination of the Amount of Regional Performance Allowances in the Regional Personnel Board of District Morotai Island;	Promulgated on February 4 2018;

---

Decree of the Regent of Morotai Island, Number: 954/67 / KPTS / PM / 2019, Promulgated on February 4, 2018; concerning the Determination of the Amount of Regional Performance Allowances in Districts in District Morotai Island;

---

Source (Archives of the Legal Division of Morotai Island Regency)

Based on the table above, it can be seen that after the action carried out by state civil apparatus employees, in the end, the Regent of Morotai Island signed a 611 decree promotion and improved regulations regarding reward and punishment for Civilian State Apparatus as part of Civilian State Apparatus demands that must be realized. However, this policy's implementation seems half-hearted because there are still some civil servants who have been transferred to the sub-districts. Until now, the Decree of Promotion is not signed by the Regent, and even the Regent also gives an excuse if almost all civil servants carry out the demonstration, become the legal basis for the transfer and dismissal of civil servants from structural positions Echelon II, III and IV. To support steps to resolve employment problems.

### *3.4 Disgrace Civilian State Apparatus Morotai Follow-up Report to State Civil Apparatus Commission and the Ministry of Home Affairs*

Movements in staffing are divided into two, namely mutations in position and mutations in place. In implementing mutations, both promotion and demotion, there are considerations in its implementation. One of them is the consideration in a promotion or demotion is an award due to work performance as stipulated in article 72 point one (1) Promotion of civil servants is carried out based on an objective comparison between the competencies, qualifications, and requirements required by the position. An assessment of work performance, leadership, cooperation, creativity, and consideration of the civil servant performance appraisal team at Government Agencies, regardless of gender, ethnicity, religion, race, and class. However, in its development, the regional head instructed the Regional Civil Service Agency to sentence 43 state civil apparatus people who were placed in 5 (five) sub-districts through decree, Regarding the Procedure for Imposing Civil Servant Discipline for all Regional Apparatus Organization accompanied by an attachment regarding the list of names of civil servants who will be subject to disciplinary sanctions.

Then after that, the Head of the Regional Civil Service Agency has issued a letter Number: 800/214/2019, Regarding the Submission of Evidence of Disciplinary Violations of Civil Service Agency accompanied by an attachment regarding the list of penal law dropouts for Civil Servants according to the absences from January to July 2019. This is what triggered the anger of the Civil Service Agency whose names were listed in the letter, apart from being done in a discriminatory manner also because they did not have a clear basis because according to the attendance, attendance at each sub-district was different from the absentee summary issued by the Regional Civil Service Agency.

This was followed by a letter of dismissal for some Civil Service Agency being highlighted. Even though demotions or transfers carried out by the Morotai Island Regency Regional, Civil Service must be carried out based on Government Regulation number 53 of 2011 concerning employee discipline, including demotions for civil servants who commit serious violations, even at the level of verbal, written and dismissal warnings. However, this regulatory aspect was ignored by the Regional Head Morotai, so that it was suspected that the regional civil service agency Morotai had made unilateral decisions. From this aspect, some Civil Service Agency Morotai submitted reports of violations of the Merit System Principles and conflicts with laws and regulations to the State Civil Apparatus Commission and Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia, so the agency immediately responded. The response from the institution can be seen in the following figure:

From the complaints filed by Civil Service Agency Morotai, who felt discriminated against, State Civil Apparatus Commission and Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia, but from the researchers' observation to date, there has been no follow-up done by the staffing advisory officials, causing a prolonged conflict against subordinates and leader.

The figure emphasizes that in the preparation of a Regional Head Regulation, in this case, the Regent/ City Regulation is one of the regional instruments in the implementation of regional government administration tasks. It must pay attention to the provisions of the laws and regulations that are more up-to-date; this can be identified in each "preamble" Raperkada at the time of submission or even until it is determined. Draft regional regulations are still understood as a basis for implementing programs or activities. Ideally, each preparation must refer to the provisions so that the formed regulations remain in line with higher regulations and equivalent regulations. This illustrates that in substance, the reasons for the formation of regional head regulations must be based on direct orders from higher levels of legislation or based on the powers they have because the national legal system is a legal building of one unit from

the highest level to the lowest level following the principle of the hierarchy so that there must be synchronization and harmonization between the regulations below and the regulations above.

The basis for filing an objection made by Civil Service Agency Morotai is referring to the explanation of point 1 to point 4. The Morotai Island Regent Regulation Number 01 of 2019 concerning the Delegation of Part of the Regent's Authority to the Regional Secretary. Regarding the Signing of Decree on Transfer, Appointment and Dismissal of Civil Service Agency indicates a conflict with Article 14 paragraph 1, Government Regulation Number 9 of 2003, concerning the Authority to Appoint, Transfer and Dismiss Civil Servants as amended by Government Regulation Number 63 of 2009 concerning Amendments to Government Regulation Number 9 of 2003, concerning Authorities for Appointment, Transfer, and Dismissal of Civil Servants where the District/City Regional Civil Service Officer determines: letter c. the appointment, transfer, and dismissal of Civil Servants in and from structural echelon II positions within the Regency/ City Government; letter d. appointment, transfer, and dismissal of Civil Servants in and from structural positions echelon III and below and functional positions at the same level as structural positions echelon II and below in the District/ City Government (See Government Regulation Number 63 of 2009 concerning Amendments to Regulations Government Number 9 of 2003, concerning the Authority to Appoint, Transfer and Dismiss Civil Servants).

#### 4 Conclusion

The conclusions in this study are:

- a) The Bureaucratic Conflict of the Morotai Island Regency is classified as a constructive conflict and a destructive conflict. Namely where the parties involved are the superiors with the Bureaucracy as their subordinates. Regional Heads as Civilian State Apparatus Trustees were highlighted, appearing to have poured non-populist policies in determining the direction and professionalism of state civil apparatus. As a result, the government is less productive in realizing the spirit of bureaucratic reform in the Morotai Island Regency, followed by a prolonged conflict that has been highlighted.
- b) The implications of non-populist policies lead to resistance movements in the form of demonstrations to express the disappointment carried out by Civilian State Apparatus towards regional heads. However, after the demonstration's implementation, it was also followed by political maneuvers from stakeholders (in this case, the Acting Regional Secretary). So, after the demonstration, there was the Regent's discretion or authority to the Regional Secretary. Instead of dissolving the problem, this authority was used as means of proof for the Regent so that the Acting Regional Secretary carried out the transfer process, and dismissal of Civilian State Apparatus was highlighted without any guidance from the staffing coach.
- c) The conflict is still being felt to date, as evidenced by the existence of legal efforts made by state civil apparatus which are discriminated against by civil servant officials so that the steps taken by Civilian State Apparatus are filing complaints to State Civil Apparatus Commission and Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia, after which the agency responds to overturn the Regent's decision / Acting Regional Secretary. However, the policy has not been heeded until now.

#### *Conflict of interest statement*

The authors declared that they have no competing interests.

#### *Statement of authorship*

The authors have a responsibility for the conception and design of the study. The authors have approved the final article.

#### *Acknowledgments*

We authors would like to thank all colleagues and supervisors for their support and feedback during the process of completing this project. We also appreciate the sponsorship from the university and minister of technology and research of the Republic of Indonesia.

**References**

- Aslan. (2019, January 17). *Pergeseran Nilai Di Masyarakat Perbatasan (Studi tentang Pendidikan dan Perubahan Sosial di Desa Temajuk Kalimantan Barat)* [Disertasi dipublikasikan]. Pasca Sarjana. <https://idr.uin-antasari.ac.id/10997/>
- Barua, M., Bhagwat, S. A., & Jadhav, S. (2013). The hidden dimensions of human–wildlife conflict: health impacts, opportunity and transaction costs. *Biological Conservation*, 157, 309-316. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2012.07.014>
- Berg, B. L. (2001). *Qualitative Research Methods For The Social Sciences*. Allyn and bacon.
- Cassell, C., Cunliffe, A. L., & Grandy, G. (2017). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Business and Management Research Methods: History and Traditions*. SAGE.
- Dalimunthe, S. F. (2016). Manajemen konflik dalam organisasi. *Jurnal Bahas Unimed*, 27(1), 78255.
- Fisher, S., Matovic, V., Ludin, J., Abdi, D. I., Walker, B. A., Smith, R., Mathews, D., Williams, S., & Williams, S. (2000). *Working with Conflict 2: Skills and Strategies for Action*. Zed Books.
- Giessen, L., Krott, M., & Möllmann, T. (2014). Increasing representation of states by utilitarian as compared to environmental bureaucracies in international forest and forest–environmental policy negotiations. *Forest Policy and Economics*, 38, 97-104. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.forpol.2013.08.008>
- Hedges, J. (2002). The importance of posting and interaction with the education bureaucracy in becoming a teacher in Ghana. *International journal of educational development*, 22(3-4), 353-366. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0738-0593\(01\)00057-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0738-0593(01)00057-8)
- Flick, U. (2013). *The SAGE handbook of qualitative data analysis*. Sage.
- Heridiansyah, J. (2014). Manajemen konflik dalam sebuah organisasi. *Jurnal STIE Semarang (Edisi Elektronik)*, 6(1), 28–41.
- Meleong, L. J. (2008). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Muspawi, M. (2014). *Manajemen konflik (upaya penyelesaian konflik dalam organisasi)*. Jambi University.
- Roth, K., & Nigh, D. (1992). The effectiveness of headquarters–subsidiary relationships: The role of coordination, control, and conflict. *Journal of Business Research*, 25(4), 277-301. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0148-2963\(92\)90025-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0148-2963(92)90025-7)
- Sahide, M. A. K., & Giessen, L. (2015). The fragmented land use administration in Indonesia—Analysing bureaucratic responsibilities influencing tropical rainforest transformation systems. *Land Use Policy*, 43, 96-110. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2014.11.005>
- Sopandi, D. (2019). The Expenditure Process of the State Budget (APBN) Funds with the State Treasury and Budget (SPAN) System in the Perspective of Bureaucratic Reform: Case Study at State Treasury Service Office Denpasar. *International Research Journal of Engineering, IT and Scientific Research*, 5(6), 12-17.
- Suryanata, I. G. N. P., & Pemayun, A. G. P. (2018). Contribution of business society credit increasing for society income. *International research journal of management, IT and social sciences*, 5(4), 71-79.
- Willig, C., & Rogers, W. S. (2017). *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research in psychology*. Sage.